**Protecting Workers Abroad and Industries at Home:**

**Rights-Based Conditionality in Trade Preference Programs**

**Supplemental Materials**

**Table A: Variable Descriptions**

| **Variable** | **Description** |
| --- | --- |
| Review | Coded as “1” where the beneficiary country is subject to a GSP review during a given year and “0” otherwise. Also coded as “1” in any subsequent years where the USTR continues its review beyond the year of filing. Coded based on search of the Federal Register.  |
| Suspended | Takes on a value of “1” for those countries that have their beneficiary status revoked in a given year and “0” otherwise. Coded based on search of the Federal Register.  |
| All Sanctions | When there is no GSP-related action in a given country-year, this variable is coded as “0”; if a petition is accepted for review, or the USTR continues an existing review, it is represented by “1”; it takes on a value of “2” when a beneficiary’s status is suspended. Coded based on search of the Federal Register.  |
| Petition Accepted | This variable is coded as “1” if an interest group filed a petition against a country and the USTR accepted the petition for review during the year under consideration. Coded based on search of the Federal Register. |
| Petition last3yrs | This variable is coded as “1” if an interest group filed a petition against a country and the USTR accepted the petition for review during the year under consideration. Coded based on search of the Federal Register. |
| Worker Rights Violations | Measures the extent to which workers enjoy freedom of association at their workplaces and the right to bargain collectively with their employers. Coding is based on the U.S. State Department *Annual Country Reports on Human Rights Practices.* The variable is measured from 0-2, with 2 representing more favorable worker rights practices. We use the inverse of this variable for ease of interpretation. The data are from the CIRI Human Rights database, <http://www.humanrightsdata.org> |
| Import Sensitive Products | U.S. imports from a given country, in all “import sensitive” categories. Two-digit industries those for which the U.S.’s revealed comparative advantage score is below the mean, as classified by Richardson and Zhang (1999). Includes SITC categories 61-69, 75, 76, 78, 81-85, 88 and 89. The data were obtained from the UN COMTRADE database. To calculate logged values, we add 1 to any observation with a value of zero. A short description of each SITC category is provided below:61 - Leather, leather manufactures, n.e.s., and dressed furskins62 - Rubber manufactures, n.e.s.63 - Cork and wood manufactures (excluding furniture)64 - Paper, paperboard and articles of paper pulp, of paper or of paperboard65 - Textile yarn, fabrics, made-up articles, n.e.s., and related products66 - Non-metallic mineral manufactures, n.e.s.67 - Iron and steel68 - Non-ferrous metals69 - Manufactures of metals, n.e.s.[75](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=75) - Office machines and automatic data-processing machines[76](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=76) - Telecommunications and sound-recording and reproducing apparatus and equipment[78](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=78) - Road vehicles (including air-cushion vehicles)[81](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=81) - Prefabricated buildings; sanitary, plumbing, heating and lighting fixtures and fittings, n.e.s.[82](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=82) - Furniture, and parts thereof; bedding, mattresses, mattress supports, cushions and similar stuffed furnishings[83](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=83) - Travel goods, handbags and similar containers[84](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=84) - Articles of apparel and clothing accessories[85](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=85) - Footwear[88](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=88) - Photographic apparatus, equipment and supplies and optical goods, n.e.s.; watches and clocks[89](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/registry/regcs.asp?Cl=14&Lg=1&Co=89) - Miscellaneous manufactured articles, n.e.s. |
| Total Imports | Total imports from country in question into the U.S. for each country-year. To calculate logged values, 1 is added to any observation with a value of zero. The majority of the data are from the UN COMTRADE database. In some instances, data were taken from the Correlates of War Trade Dataset and the U.S. Census Bureau Foreign Trade Statistics Database. |
| GDP Per Capita   | Country GDP per capita in constant U.S. dollars, logged. These data are drawn from Graham and Tucker (2016). |
| Unemployment | The annual unemployment rate, lagged one year. Data are from the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics.  |
| Population | Total population, lagged one year. The data are from the World Bank World Development Indicators, and are supplemented with data from the Penn World Tables to supplement. The data are drawn from Graham and Tucker (2016).  |
| Pres Party  | Coded 1 if president is a Democrat; 0 otherwise.  |
| Democratic Congress | Coded 1 if the House and Senate are controlled by the Democratic Party; 0 otherwise.  |
| UN Ideal Point Diff | The absolute difference in the UN ideal point between the U.S. and the country in question, based on UN voting record (lagged one year). These data are based on Bailey et al’s 2017 update. |
| PTS (state dept.) | Level of political violence and terror based on a 5-cateory “terror scale.” The original variable ranges from 1 (low level of political terror) to 5 (high level of political terror). To aid interpretation, we invert the scale. Data taken from the Political Terror Scale Database, http://www.politicalterrorscale.org |
| US GSP Imports | Total U.S. imports from each GSP beneficiary member, in current U.S. dollars. The data are available only from 1996 to 2011. This variable is taken from the USITC database. Available at http://dataweb.usitc.gov. We use the logarithmic transformation of this variable. |
| Polity | Variable is coded on a scale from -10 to 10, with higher numbers representing more democratic regimes. See Graham and Tucker (2016). |
| Mosley-Uno | Measure of collective labor rights, ranging from 0 to 34.5. Higher scores represent better labor rights outcomes. The data are from Mosley, Layna and Uno, Saika, Racing to the Bottom or Climbing to the Top? Economic Globaization and Collective Labor Rights, Comparative Political Studies 2007 40: 923-948. |
| CNL $ Value | The annual dollar amount (logged) of goods excluded from GSP, based on competitive need limitations. This value represents the import value of goods that would theoretically be eligible for GSP treatment, but were nonetheless excluded because the beneficiary in question was deemed sufficiently competitive in producing the product. The data are from Blanchard and Hakobyan (2015). |
| Tariff Lines Suspended | The total number of tariff lines suspended from GSP eligibility during the year in question. The data are from Blanchard and Hakobyan (2015). |
| Current Beneficiary  | Coded as 1 if the country in question was a recipient of GSP benefits during the year in quesiton. |
| Potential Beneficiary  | Coded as 1 if the country had previously been a recipient of GSP benefits, and did not meet mandatory ineligibility criteria, e.g., income status, EU membership, US FTA membership. Given the discretion with which certain eligibility criteria are applied, we relied on this restrictive coding to be conservative (see Blanchard and Matschke 2015 for a discussion).  |
| Lat Am | This variable is a dummy variable coded as 1 for countries located in Latin America. |
| LDBC | This variable is coded as 1 for any country that is designated as a Least Developed Beneficiary Country. |
| NOTE: See “Label” field in .dta files for concordance with Stata variable name. |

**Table B: Rare Event Logits**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|   | Model 1  | Model 2 |
|  | R.E. Logit | R.E. Logit |
| Dependent Variable:  | Review | Suspend |
| Variable Name  |   |   |
|  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.502\*\* | 1.069\*\* |
|  |  (0.20) |  (0.46) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.607\*\*\* | -0.167 |
|  |  (0.20) |  (0.11) |
| Unemployment | 0.310\*\*\* | -0.185\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.09) |  (0.06) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 0.154 | 1.514\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.26) |  (0.54) |
| Pres Party | -0.641\*\* | 0.329\* |
|  |  (0.32) |  (0.18) |
| Democratic Congress  | 0.959\*\*\* | -0.109 |
|   |  (0.23) |  (0.23) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.351\* | 0.117 |
|   |  (0.18) |  (0.26) |
| Population | -0.036 | 0.244 |
|   |  (0.12) |  (0.17) |
| Intercept | -6.387\*\*\* | -10.104\*\*\* |
|  |  (2.35) |  (3.81) |
| N | 2902 | 2902 |
| Countries in analysis | 150 | 150 |

* Models 1-2 are rare event logit models.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table C: Total Imports Variable**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
|  | Logit | Logit | Ordered Logit |
| Dependent Variable:  | Review | Suspend | Ordinal |
| Variable Name  |   |   |   |
|  |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.443\*\* | 1.077\*\* | 0.755\*\*\* |
|  |  (0.20) |  (0.47) |  (0.24) |
| Total Imports | 0.647\*\*\* | -0.295\*\*\* | -0.088 |
|   |  (0.24) |  (0.11) |  (0.13) |
| Unemployment | 0.268\*\*\* | -0.207\*\*\* | 0.036 |
|   |  (0.09) |  (0.07) |  (0.07) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 0.011 | 1.549\*\*\* | 0.814\*\* |
|   |  (0.28) |  (0.54) |  (0.38) |
| Pres Party | -0.603\* | 0.327\* | -0.043 |
|  |  (0.32) |  (0.18) |  (0.19) |
| Democratic Congress  | 0.963\*\*\* | -0.096 | 0.378\*\* |
|   |  (0.23) |  (0.23) |  (0.18) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.376\* | 0.216 | 0.119 |
|   |  (0.22) |  (0.26) |  (0.17) |
| Population | 0.000 | 0.319\* | 0.307\*\* |
|   |  (0.12) |  (0.18) |  (0.14) |
| Intercept | -6.906\*\*\* | -10.890\*\*\* |  |
|   |  (2.39) |  (3.96) |  |
| Pseudo R2  | 0.12 | 0.20 | 0.09 |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -594.46 | -458.10 | -1096.631 |
| N | 2902 | 3030 | 3030 |
| Countries in analysis | 150 | 150 | 150 |

NOTES:

* Models 1-3 are logit models.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table D: Petition Acceptance**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1  | Model 2 |
|  | Logit | Logit |
| Variable Name  |   |   |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.465\*\* | 0.411\*\* |
|  |  (0.18) |  (0.18) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.586\*\*\* |  |
|  |  (0.15) |  |
| Total Imports |  | 0.649\*\*\* |
|   |  |  (0.20) |
| Unemployment | 0.514\*\*\* | 0.477\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.13) |  (0.13) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | -0.138 | -0.276 |
|   |  (0.22) |  (0.22) |
| Pres Party | -1.727\*\*\* | -1.700\*\*\* |
|  |  (0.50) |  (0.50) |
| Democratic Congress  | 1.532\*\*\* | 1.549\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.29) |  (0.29) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.333\* | -0.364\* |
|   |  (0.17) |  (0.20) |
| Population | -0.059 | -0.037 |
|   |  (0.10) |  (0.10) |
| Intercept | -7.643\*\*\* | -8.103\*\*\* |
|   |  (2.22) |  (2.17) |
| Pseudo R2  | 0.14 | 0.13 |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -260.3 | -263.32 |
| N | 2902 | 2902 |

NOTES:

* Models 1 and 2 are logit models.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table E: Selection Models (Modelling Beneficiary Status)**

Stage 1: Beneficiary Status;

Stage 2: Sanction (Petition Accepted; Review; Suspend)

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Model 1  | Model 2 | Model 3 |
|  | Logit | Logit | Ordered Logit |
| Dependent Variable:  | Review | Suspend | Ordinal |
|   |   |   |   |
| **Outcome Equation** |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.230\*\*\* | 0.284\*\*\* | 0.271\* |
|  |  (0.08) |  (0.10) |  (0.16) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.200\*\*\* | 0.233\*\*\* | 0.06 |
|   |  (0.05) |  (0.07) |  (0.07) |
| Unemployment | 0.198\*\*\* | 0.138\*\*\* | -0.026 |
|   |  (0.06) |  (0.04) |  (0.08) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | -0.063 | 0.067 | 0.319 |
|   |  (0.09) |  (0.13) |  (0.22) |
| Pres Party | -0.633\*\*\* | -0.240\* | -0.097 |
|   |  (0.20) |  (0.14) |  (0.20) |
| Democratic Congress  | 0.618\*\*\* | 0.459\*\*\* | 0.201 |
|  |  (0.12) |  (0.11) |  (0.25) |
| Population | 0.041 | 0.062 | 0.114 |
|   |  (0.04) |  (0.05) |  (0.07) |
| intercept | -4.974\*\*\* | -4.992\*\*\* | -5.301\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.60) |  (0.81) |  (1.19) |
| **Selection Equation** |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | -0.084 | -0.081 | -0.084 |
|  |  (0.10) |  (0.10) |  (0.10) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.215\*\*\* | 0.216\*\*\* | 0.215\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.04) |  (0.04) |  (0.04) |
| Unemployment | 0.028 | 0.029 | 0.028 |
|   |  (0.02) |  (0.02) |  (0.02) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 0.029 | 0.03 | 0.028 |
|   |  (0.09) |  (0.09) |  (0.09) |
| Pres Party | -0.154\*\*\* | -0.153\*\* | -0.154\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.06) |  (0.06) |  (0.06) |
| Democratic Congress  | -0.05 | -0.049 | -0.05 |
|   |  (0.05) |  (0.05) |  (0.05) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.748\*\*\* | -0.750\*\*\* | -0.747\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.09) |  (0.09) |  (0.09) |
| Population | -0.306\*\*\* | -0.307\*\*\* | -0.305\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.05) |  (0.05) |  (0.05) |
| intercept | 9.629\*\*\* | 9.657\*\*\* | 9.620\*\*\* |
|   |  (1.29) |  (1.29) |  (1.28) |
| rho | -0.472\*\*\* | -0.602\*\*\* | -0.42 |
|  |  (0.16) |  (0.22) |  (0.26) |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -2173.02 | -2490.30 | -2016.03 |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| N | 4395 | 4395 | 4395 |
| Countries in analysis | 188 | 188 | 188 |

 NOTES:

* Models 1-3 are Heckman Probit models.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table F: Selection Models (Modelling Petition Filing)**

Stage 1: Petition Filed;

Stage 2: Sanction (Review; Suspend; Ordered)

**Stage 1**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3  |
|  | Logit | Logit | Ordered Logit |
| Dependent Variable:  | Review | Suspend | Ordinal |
|   |   |   |   |
| Outcome Equation |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.079 | 0.283\*\*\* | 0.379\* |
|  |  (0.20) |  (0.11) |  (0.20) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.142 | 0.275\*\*\* | -0.231 |
|   |  (0.21) |  (0.10) |  (0.23) |
| Unemployment | 0.214\*\* | 0.314\*\*\* | 0.100 |
|   |  (0.09) |  (0.10) |  (0.10) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | -0.253 | 0.024 | 0.119 |
|   |  (0.21) |  (0.16) |  (0.35) |
| Pres Party | -0.362 | -0.369\* | -0.181 |
|   |  (0.26) |  (0.21) |  (0.39) |
| Democratic Congress  | 0.506 | 0.443\*\* | 0.578\* |
|  |  (0.41) |  (0.20) |  (0.32) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.269 | -0.427\*\*\* | -0.226 |
|   |  (0.18) |  (0.10) |  (0.25) |
| Population | -0.029 | -0.098 | -0.097 |
|   |  (0.13) |  (0.08) |  (0.17) |
| intercept | 0.014 | -0.702 | 2.331 |
|   |  (2.25) |  (1.75) |  (4.01) |

**Stage 2**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.188\*\* | 0.187\*\* | 0.188\*\* |
|  |  (0.08) |  (0.08) |  (0.08) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.303\*\*\* | 0.302\*\*\* | 0.302\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.07) |  (0.07) |  (0.07) |
| Unemployment | -0.008 | -0.008 | -0.008 |
|   |  (0.03) |  (0.03) |  (0.03) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 0.149 | 0.148 | 0.149 |
|   |  (0.11) |  (0.11) |  (0.11) |
| Pres Party | -0.081 | -0.082 | -0.082 |
|   |  (0.11) |  (0.10) |  (0.11) |
| Democratic Congress  | 0.521\*\*\* | 0.522\*\*\* | 0.521\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.08) |  (0.08) |  (0.08) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.275\*\*\* | -0.276\*\*\* | -0.275\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.06) |  (0.06) |  (0.06) |
| Population | -0.037 | -0.037 | -0.037 |
|   |  (0.05) |  (0.05) |  (0.05) |
| Lat Am | 0.613\*\*\* | 0.615\*\*\* | 0.613\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.17) |  (0.17) |  (0.17) |
| intercept | -1.738\*\* | -1.738\*\* | -1.740\*\* |
|  |  (0.88) |  (0.88) |  (0.88) |
| rho | -0.535 | 0.961\*\* | 0.084 |
|   |  (0.50) |  (0.41) |  (0.55) |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -937.17 | -1041.62 | -937.65 |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.13 | 0.00 | 0.03 |
| N | 4395 | 4395 | 4395 |
| Countries in analysis | 188 | 188 | 188 |

 NOTES:

* Models 1-3 are Heckman Probit models.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table G: Models using Alternative Worker Rights Variables:**

**Mosley-Uno/Polity/Political Terror Scale**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|   | Model 1  | Model 2 | Model 3  | Model 4 | Model 5  | Model 6 |
|  | Logit | Logit | Logit | Logit | Logit | Logit |
| Dependent Variable:  | Review | Review | Review | Suspend | Suspend | Suspend |
| Mosley-Uno | 0.118\*\*\* |  |  | 0.139\*\*\* |  |  |
|   |  (0.02) |  |  |  (0.03) |  |  |
| PTS-State Dept |  | 0.407\*\* |  |  | 0.650\*\*\* |  |
|   |  |  (0.17) |  |  |  (0.18) |  |
| Polity |  |  | -0.107\*\*\* |  |  | -0.143\* |
|   |  |  |  (0.03) |  |  |  (0.08) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.515\* | 0.566\*\*\* | 0.759\*\*\* | 0.019 | -0.159 | -0.227\*\* |
|   |  (0.28) |  (0.22) |  (0.24) |  (0.20) |  (0.10) |  (0.11) |
| Unemployment | 0.472\*\* | 0.337\*\*\* | 0.297\*\*\* | -0.007 | -0.111\* | -0.125\*\* |
|   |  (0.18) |  (0.09) |  (0.08) |  (0.13) |  (0.07) |  (0.05) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 0.086 | 0.077 | -0.163 | 1.771\*\* | 1.532\*\* | 1.034\* |
|   |  (0.42) |  (0.27) |  (0.27) |  (0.77) |  (0.62) |  (0.54) |
| Pres Party | -0.578\* | -0.681\*\* | -0.356 | 0.215 | 0.198 | 0.453\*\* |
|  |  (0.34) |  (0.33) |  (0.26) |  (0.28) |  (0.19) |  (0.21) |
| Democratic Congress  | 1.499\*\*\* | 0.876\*\*\* | 0.871\*\*\* | 0.222 | -0.068 | -0.054 |
|   |  (0.40) |  (0.22) |  (0.23) |  (0.43) |  (0.22) |  (0.23) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.283 | -0.286 | -0.3 | -0.52 | 0.206 | 0.165 |
|   |  (0.24) |  (0.19) |  (0.19) |  (0.36) |  (0.24) |  (0.30) |
| Population | -0.169 | -0.158 | -0.104 | -0.313 | -0.013 | 0.467\* |
|   |  (0.16) |  (0.16) |  (0.15) |  (0.21) |  (0.21) |  (0.26) |
| Intercept | -2.787 | -6.011\*\* | -6.017\*\* | 2.303 | -9.767\*\* | -13.278\*\* |
|   |  (3.85) |  (2.59) |  (2.64) |  (6.16) |  (4.35) |  (5.42) |
| Pseudo R2  | 0.22 | 0.12 | 0.14 | 0.23 | 0.17 | 0.2 |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -340.15 | -597.24 | -571.10 | -264.09 | -489.10 | -425.03 |
| N | 1557 | 2852 | 2590 | 1634 | 2987 | 2711 |
| Countries in analysis | 115 | 143 | 130 | 115 | 143 | 130 |

NOTES:

* Models 1-6 are logit models.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table H: Logit Models of Country-Level Review, Alternative Specifications**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 4 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.305\* | 0.506\*\*\* | 0.722\*\*\* | 0.506\*\* |
|  |  (0.17) |  (0.12) |  (0.20) |  (0.20) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.458\*\* | 0.613\*\*\* | 0.688\*\*\* | 0.613\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.18) |  (0.09) |  (0.23) |  (0.22) |
| Unemployment | 0.386\*\*\* | 0.313\*\*\* | -0.589\* | 0.313\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.08) |  (0.07) |  (0.34) |  (0.09) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 0.216 | 0.159 | 0.214 | 0.159 |
|   |  (0.30) |  (0.15) |  (0.26) |  (0.28) |
| Pres Party | -0.569\*\* | -0.650\*\*\* | 3.069\* | -0.650\* |
|  |  (0.24) |  (0.21) |  (1.66) |  (0.34) |
| Democratic Congress  | 1.311\*\*\* | 0.968\*\*\* | -0.435\*\* | 0.968\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.20) |  (0.17) |  (0.22) |  (0.25) |
| GDP Per Capita | -0.226 | -0.355\*\*\* | -0.358\* | -0.355\* |
|   |  (0.26) |  (0.10) |  (0.19) |  (0.20) |
| Population | 0.151 | -0.037 | -0.015 | -0.037 |
|   |  (0.18) |  (0.06) |  (0.13) |  (0.14) |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -474.26 | -583.44 | -552.56 | -583.44 |
| N | 2902 | 2902 | 2902 | 2902 |

NOTES:

* Models 1-4 are logit models; random effects, mixed effects, fixed effects, and bootstrap standard errors, respectively.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table I: Logit Models of Country-Level Suspensions, Alternative Specifications**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 4 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.867\*\* | 1.081\*\*\* | 1.137\*\* | 1.081\*\* |
|  |  (0.34) |  (0.18) |  (0.46) |  (0.52) |
| Import Sensitive Products | -0.057 | -0.168\*\*\* | -0.201\* | -0.168 |
|   |  (0.14) |  (0.05) |  (0.12) |  (0.18) |
| Unemployment | -0.483\*\*\* | -0.189\*\* | 0.257 | -0.189\*\* |
|   |  (0.13) |  (0.08) |  (0.38) |  (0.08) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 1.216\*\*\* | 1.533\*\*\* | 1.544\*\*\* | 1.533\*\* |
|   |  (0.39) |  (0.21) |  (0.56) |  (0.60) |
| Pres Party | 0.907\*\*\* | 0.329 | -1.349 | 0.329 |
|  |  (0.34) |  (0.20) |  (1.73) |  (0.20) |
| Democratic Congress  | 0.044 | -0.11 | -0.005 | -0.11 |
|   |  (0.32) |  (0.19) |  (0.15) |  (0.27) |
| GDP Per Capita | 0.446 | 0.115 | 0.164 | 0.115 |
|   |  (0.37) |  (0.10) |  (0.26) |  (0.31) |
| Population | 0.894\*\*\* | 0.246\*\*\* | 0.283 | 0.246 |
|   |  (0.21) |  (0.06) |  (0.19) |  (0.25) |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -195.13 | -463.03 | -448.90 | -463.03 |
| N | 3030 | 3030 | 2831 | 3030 |

NOTES:

* Models 1-4 are logit models; random effects, mixed effects, fixed effects, and bootstrap standard errors, respectively.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table J: Logit Models of Country-Level Review/Suspension (Ordinal), Alternative Specifications**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 4 |
|  | Random Effects  | Mixed Effects  | Fixed Effects  | Bootstrap  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.427\*\*\* | 0.764\*\*\* | 0.900\*\*\* | 0.777\*\*\* |
|  |  (0.16) |  (0.11) |  (0.23) |  (0.24) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.003 | 0.017 | 0.024 | 0.033 |
|   |  (0.09) |  (0.05) |  (0.17) |  (0.21) |
| Unemployment | 0.064 | 0.047 | -0.278 | 0.044 |
|   |  (0.07) |  (0.05) |  (0.27) |  (0.07) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 0.655\*\*\* | 0.870\*\*\* | 0.862\*\* | 0.839\*\* |
|   |  (0.25) |  (0.13) |  (0.36) |  (0.40) |
| Pres Party | 0.03 | -0.061 | 1.258 | -0.058 |
|  |  (0.19) |  (0.15) |  (1.27) |  (0.21) |
| Democratic Congress  | 0.738\*\*\* | 0.371\*\*\* | -0.343\*\* | 0.378\*\* |
|   |  (0.17) |  (0.13) |  (0.15) |  (0.19) |
| GDP Per Capita | 0.317 | 0.032 | 0.069 | 0.032 |
|   |  (0.23) |  (0.07) |  (0.18) |  (0.21) |
| Population | 0.528\*\*\* | 0.240\*\*\* | 0.283\* | 0.235 |
|   |  (0.18) |  (0.05) |  (0.17) |  (0.19) |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Log pseudolikelihood | -716.62 | -1062.69 | -1074.79 | -1097.60 |
| N | 3030 | 2929 | 3030 | 3030 |

NOTES:

* Models 1-4 are logit models; random effects, mixed effects, fixed effects, and bootstrap standard errors, respectively.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01

**Table K: Models of Product-Level Suspensions Excluding Argentina, India and Brazil**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 |
|  |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | 0.095 | 0.044 | 0.016 |
|   |  (0.31) |  (0.32) |  (0.32) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.447\*\*\* | 0.475\*\*\* | 0.472\*\*\* |
|  |  (0.15) |  (0.15) |  (0.15) |
| Unemployment | -0.211 | -0.205 | -0.208 |
|   |  (0.13) |  (0.13) |  (0.13) |
| GDP Per Capita | 1.050\*\*\* | 0.945\*\*\* | 0.908\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.29) |  (0.30) |  (0.30) |
| Population | 0.544\*\*\* | 0.566\*\*\* | 0.546\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.13) |  (0.14) |  (0.14) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | -0.002 | 0.013 | 0.007 |
|   |  (0.29) |  (0.30) |  (0.29) |
| intercept | -17.401\*\*\* | -17.182\*\*\* | -16.551\*\*\* |
|   |  (3.69) |  (3.82) |  (3.74) |
| N | 667 | 667 | 667 |
|  AIC  | 3205.22 | 3216.09 | 3210.49 |
| R2  | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.32 |
| Countries in analysis | 101 | 101 | 101 |

NOTES:

* Models 1-3 are OLS models; the dependent variable is the log of the total value of goods excluded based on competitive need limitations.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table L: Models of Product-Level Suspensions, Alternate Specifications**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 4 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Worker Rights Violations | -0.012 | -0.003 | 0.016 | -0.012 |
|   |  (0.08) |  (0.09) |  (0.06) |  (0.08) |
| Import Sensitive Products | 0.146\*\*\* | 0.085\* | 0.149\*\* | 0.146\* |
|  |  (0.05) |  (0.05) |  (0.06) |  (0.09) |
| Unemployment | -0.088 | -0.09 | -0.053 | -0.088 |
|   |  (0.10) |  (0.09) |  (0.11) |  (0.10) |
| GDP Per Capita | 0.882\*\*\* | 0.912 | 0.929\*\*\* | 0.882\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.25) |  (0.66) |  (0.28) |  (0.25) |
| Population | 0.659\*\*\* | 0.296 | 0.658\*\*\* | 0.659\*\*\* |
|   |  (0.13) |  (2.24) |  (0.13) |  (0.14) |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | -0.172 | -0.406 | -0.045 | -0.172 |
|   |  (0.23) |  (0.39) |  (0.35) |  (0.25) |
| intercept | -15.769\*\*\* | -9.115 | -16.704\*\*\* | -15.769\*\*\* |
|   |  (3.33) |  (33.56) |  (3.84) |  (3.43) |
| N | 675 | 675 | 675 | 675 |
| Prob > chi2 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| R2  | 0.25 | 0.33 | 0.33 | 0.33 |
| Countries in analysis | 102 | 102 | 102 | 102 |

NOTES:

* Models 1-4 are OLS models; the dependent variable is the log of the total value of goods excluded based on competitive need limitations.
* The table contains coefficients and standard errors, in parentheses.
* ∗Indicates significance at p < 0.1, ∗∗ at p < .05, ∗∗∗ at p < .01.

**Table M: Descriptive Statistics**

**Descriptive Statistics: Models 1-6**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Variable | Obs  | Mean  | Std. Dev  | Min  | Max  |
| Review | 3531 | 0.06 | 0.23 | 0.00 | 1.00 |
| Suspend | 3531 | 0.05 | 0.21 | 0.00 | 1.00 |
| All Sanctions (Ordinal) | 3531 | 0.15 | 0.47 | 0.00 | 2.00 |
| Worker Rights Violations | 3328 | -0.75 | 0.71 | -2.00 | 0.00 |
| Import Sensitive Products | 3450 | 6.93 | 1.90 | 0.00 | 10.33 |
| Unemployment | 3531 | 6.10 | 1.48 | 4.00 | 9.60 |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 3441 | 3.11 | 0.65 | 0.09 | 4.85 |
| Pres Party | 3531 | 0.46 | 0.50 | 0.00 | 1.00 |
| Democratic Congress  | 3531 | 0.39 | 0.49 | 0.00 | 1.00 |
| GDP Per Capita | 3316 | 7.64 | 1.15 | 4.75 | 10.71 |
| Population | 3363 | 15.26 | 2.10 | 9.15 | 20.96 |
| Total Imports | 3450 | 7.79 | 1.60 | 0.00 | 10.72 |
| Mosley-Uno | 1871 | 24.13 | 7.87 | 0.00 | 34.50 |
| Polity | 2992 | 1.65 | 6.38 | -10.00 | 10.00 |
| PTS | 3288 | 2.65 | 1.12 | 1.00 | 5.00 |
| LatAm | 3531 | 0.23 | 0.42 | 0.00 | 1.00 |

**Descriptive Statistics: Models 7-10**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Variable | Obs  | Mean  | Std. Dev  | Min  | Max  |
| CNL $ Value (logged)  | 1024 | 1.20 | 2.81 | 0.00 | 9.42 |
| Tariff Lines Suspended | 1024 | 4.39 | 38.09 | 0.00 | 688.00 |
| Worker Rights Violations | 1008 | -0.72 | 0.63 | -2.00 | 0.00 |
| Import Sensitive Products | 1020 | 7.05 | 1.87 | 0.00 | 10.24 |
| Total Imports | 1020 | 7.96 | 1.46 | 0.00 | 10.72 |
| Unemployment | 1024 | 5.27 | 0.55 | 4.60 | 6.00 |
| GDP Per Capita | 1002 | 7.67 | 1.13 | 5.27 | 10.16 |
| Population | 1016 | 15.34 | 2.18 | 9.16 | 20.90 |
| UN Ideal Point Diff.  | 1010 | 3.16 | 0.68 | 0.20 | 4.54 |
| LDBC | 1024 | 0.32 | 0.47 | 0.00 | 1.00 |

**Figure A: Average CIRI Scores of Potential Beneficiaries**



 **Figure B: Official GSP Imports, annual (From ITC dataweb)**



**Figure C: Dependent Variable Distribution**



**References**

Bailey, M.A., Strezhnev, A. and Voeten, E., 2017. Estimating dynamic state preferences from United Nations voting data. Journal of Conflict Resolution, 61(2):430-456.

Blanchard, Emily and X. Matschke, 2015, “U.S. Multinationals and Preferential Market Access,” Review of Economics and Statistics, 97(4).

Graham, Benjamin A.T.; Tucker, Jacob R., 2016, "The International Political Economy Data Resource", doi:10.7910/DVN/X093TV, Harvard Dataverse, V2.

Richardson, J. David, and Chi Zhang. 1999. Revealing Comparative Advantage: Chaotic or Coherent Patterns Across Time and Sector and U.S. Trading Partner? NBER Working Paper 7212. Cambridge, Mass: National Bureau of Economic Research.